American Oriental Society

FOUNDED 1842



Western Branch Meeting

October 10-12, 1997 University of Colorado

American Oriental Society FOUNDED 1842

President: Stanley Insler

Vice-President: Chauncey S. Goodrich

Secretary-Treasurer: Jonathan Rodgers

Editor-in-Chief: Edwin Gerow (South Asia and Inner Asia)

Sectional Editors:

Paul W. Kroll (East Asia), Jack M. Sasson (Ancient Near East), Jeanette A. Wakin (Islam)

Board of Directors:

Gary Beckman, Mark W. Chavalas, Robert Joe Cutter, Robert Dankoff, Edwin Gerow, Chauncey S. Goodrich, Stanley Insler, Stephanie W. Jamison, Richard W. Lariviere, Ruth I. Meserve, Jonathan Rodgers, Martha T. Roth, Everett K. Rowson, Timothy C. Wong

Western Branch FOUNDED 1951

President: Edwin Gerow

Vice-President: Stephen H. West

Secretary-Treasurer: Stephen Wadley

Executive Committee:

William G. Boltz, Daniel Bryant, David R. Knechtges, Richard Salomon, Timothy C. Wong

> 1997 Meeting Boulder, Colorado

Host: Department of East Asian Languages and Literatures University of Colorado

Assistance from the Dean's Office, College of Arts and Sciences, is gratefully acknowledged.

AMERICAN ORIENTAL SOCIETY

WESTERN BRANCH MEETING

University of Colorado October 10-12, 1997

All sessions will be held in the Alpine Room (4th floor), College Inn Conference Center. All coffee/snack breaks will be in the Mountain View Room (4th floor).

FRIDAY MORNING, OCT. 10

Registration. 7:45 onward: Mountain View Room.

8:15: Welcoming Remarks
Carol B. LYNCH

Dean of the Graduate School and Associate Vice-Chancellor for Research University of Colorado

> 8:20-10:00: Session 1. Topics in Han China Chair: Paul W. Kroll

Chauncey S. GOODRICH, University of California, Santa Barbara "Tung-fang Shuo: Jester, Buffoon, and Immortal"

David R. KNECHTGES, University of Washington "Does Poetry Inspire a Building Project? Emperor Wu of the Former Han and Sima Xiangru's 'Fu on the Imperial Park'"

David B. HONEY, Brigham Young University
"Songs from Seclusion: A Rhetorical Reading of Shih-chi 9, 'Basic Annals of
Grand Dowager Lü'"

Scott W. GALER, University of Wisconsin
"Another Look at 'The Basic Annals of Emperor Ching the Filial':
'Exasperatingly Dull'... or Not?"

10:15-11:55: Session 2. Topics in Nan-pei-ch'ao, Sui, and T'ang Times Chair: Donald Holzman

LU Zongli, Hong Kong University of Science and Technology "Myth or History? The Battle of the Fei River"

Paul W. KROLL, University of Colorado "The Road to Shu, Before Li Po"

Ding Xiang WARNER, Pacific Lutheran University
"The Role of Wang Tong (584?-617) and his Academy"

J. Michael FARMER, University of Wisconsin "Some Notes on the Historiographical Tradition in Early Medieval Shu"

12:00-12:20: Annual Business Meeting of the AOS, Western Branch

FRIDAY AFTERNOON, OCT. 10

1:50-3:30: Session 3. Topics in Han and Nan-pei-ch'ao Times Chair: David R. Knechtges

- Donald HOLZMAN, École des Hautes Études en Sciences Sociales, Paris "Filial Piety: China's Bane or Glory?"
- Mark L. ASSELIN, Lewis and Clark College "The Continuity of the Han Epitaph"
- SU Jui-lung, National University of Singapore
 "The Development and Transformation of the 'Sevens'"
- WANG Wei, University of Colorado

 "The Lost Paradise: A Different Reading of 'The Record of Peach Blossom Spring'"

3:45-4:55: Session 4. Topics in Ninth-Century China Chair: Chauncey S. Goodrich

- Madeline K. SPRING, University of Colorado "Words of Caution from Liu Yuxi"
- Robert ASHMORE, University of California, Berkeley
 "'The Stone Kettle Linked Verses' and Ninth-Century Wit"
- Suzanne CAHILL, University of California, San Diego
 "T'ang Material Culture and the Tao: A New Look at the Poetry of
 Yü Hsüan-chi"

SATURDAY MORNING, OCT. 11

8:30-10:10: Session 5. Sino-Japanese, Japanese, and Muslim Topics Chair: David B. Honey

- Muhammad AMANULLAH, University of Utah
 "Controversy over the Amount of Blood Money for a Non-Muslin *Dhimmi* or
 Mu'ahid Victim"
- Edward E. PENG, Brigham Young University
 "The Sketchy Haiku and the Heideggerian Sense of Time"
- Richard John LYNN, University of Alberta "Huang Zunxian (1848-1905) and his Association with Meiji-Era Japanese Literati"
- Stuart H. SARGENT, Colorado State University
 "The Dialogue between Haiku and Chinese Poetry"

10:25-11:40: Session 6. Topics in Early Chinese Thought and History, I Chair: Laurence G. Thompson

- JIA Jinhua, University of Colorado

 "An Interpretation of 'shi ke yi qun' 詩可以群"
- Martin KERN, University of Göttingen/ University of Washington "The Stele Inscriptions of Ch'in Shih-huang: Mutations within the Tradition of Chou Political Ritual"
- David S. NIVISON, Stanford University "The Riddle of the Bamboo Annals"

1:15-2:55: Session 7. **Topics in Chinese Religion** Chair: Stephen Durrant

YU Shiyi, University of Colorado "Taoist Scripture-Teaching and Interpretation of the Classics in Medieval China"

Jan NATTIER, Indiana University
"Searching for the Elusive 'Pure Land': A Prakrit Prototype of ching-t'u 净土?"

Tim Wai-keung CHAN, University of Colorado
"A Poem on Daoist Esoteric and Exoteric Practices by Chen Ziang"

Laurence G. THOMPSON, University of Southern California "Chinese Religion Studies: Observations on Recent Bibliography"

3:10-4:50: Session 8. Topics in Later Chinese Literature and Cultural History
Chair: Madeline K. Spring

Timothy C. WONG, Arizona State University
"Fiction as Pretense in the Chinese Tradition"

Stephen H. WEST, University of California, Berkeley "Court, Desire, and Consumption in the Eastern Capital of the Northern Song"

Stephen WADLEY, Portland State University
"Stuck in Pekin Singin Dem Ol' Manchu Blues"

Victoria CASS, University of Colorado
"Geishas in the Southern Cities of the Late Ming: Wealthy Entrepreneurs,
Published Writers, and Social Iconoclasts—Another Reflection of the jubian"

SATURDAY EVENING, OCT. 11

AOS-Western Branch Banquet 6:30: Dolan's Restaurant, University Room

Presidential Address: Edwin GEROW, Reed College "Karma a Portable Notion?" 8:45-9:35: Session 9. Topics in Early Chinese Thought and History, II
Chair: Timothy C. Wong

Stephen DURRANT, University of Oregon
"Did the Luese and Qiese Save Civilization? (And Did Sima Qian Like Them?)

Howard Y. F. CHOY, University of Colorado "Did Confucius Take Showers? An Etymological Trace of ru 儒 "

9:50-11:30: Session 10. Topics in Chinese Literary History Chair: Stephen H. West

Daniel HSIEH, Purdue University
"Scholar-foxes in Chinese Fox Stories"

Deborah RUDOLPH, University of California, Berkeley
"The Vernacularization of Morality: Yüan Chen's 'Tale of Ying-ying' and
Wang Shih-fu's Story of the Western Wing"

Shu Yong JIANG, University of Wisconsin
"The Development of Wu Tzu-hsü's Story in Li Shou-ch'ing's Wu Yün
ch'ui hsiao"

Kathleen TOMLONOVIC, Western Washington University
"A Preference for Chronology in the Transmission of Poetry Collections of Song Dynasty Literati"

ABSTRACTS OF PAPERS

Session 1

Chancey S. GOODRICH, "Tung-fang Shuo: Jester, Buffoon, and Immortal"

The career of Tung-fang Shuo is complex and fascinating. Much of it surely belongs to fiction: how much it is hard to say.

This paper will treat the sources of the story in the *Shih chi* and the *Han shu*, emphasizing the importance of special insights and magical powers and the relationship with Han Wu-ti. The accounts in the *Lieh-hsien chuan* and the *Feng-su t'ung-i* will be considered. In Later Han times he seems to have become a Taoist immortal (*hsien*). Certain texts make him a reincarnation of ancient illustrious figures and identify him with the planet Venus. When the various heroic tales of Han Wu-ti (*Han Wu ku-shih*, *Han Wu-ti nei-chuan*) came into being, Tung-fang Shuo played a prominent role. Again, his connection with hidden supernatural forces is prominent, including a role in the relationship of Wu-ti and the mythic Hsi Wang Mu.

David R. KNECHTGES, "Does Poetry Inspire a Building Project? Emperor Wu of the Former Han and Sima Xiangru's 'Fu on the Imperial Park'"

During the reign of Emperor Wu of the Former Han, the imperial court undertook large building projects. In his most recent book, Monumentality in Chinese Art and Architecture, Wu Hung examines the role that Emperor Wu played in these projects, especially the "expansion" of the Shanglin Park. He argues that in carrying out his ambitious building enterprises, Emperor Wu was not inspired by practical administrators or ritualists, but "necromancers who played at conjuring and writers who played with words. Through the emperor, the fantasies of these two groups of men gained material form" (p. 167). According to Wu Hung, Emperor Wu decided to expand the great imperial preserve, the Shanglin yuan, after reading Sima Xiangru's "Shanglin fu." Emperor Wu was so ashamed that his own park was so "shabby" that he set out "to create an actual park on earth that matched Sima Xiangru's fictional garden, with all its landscape features, strange animals, and birds, magnificent palaces and towers, beautiful women and brave warriors" (p. 172). I wish to examine in this paper the validity of of Wu Hung's interpretation of Sima Xiangru's "Shanglin fu" and the motivations he attributes to Emperor Wu's decision to expand the Shanglin Park. I examine, first of all, the historical evidence we have concerning Emperor Wu's expansion of the park. This evidence shows that rather than simply being a replica of a "fictional garden," the Shanglin yuan was a place for diverse activities, many of them practical: hunting, farming, housing the military, and minting of coins. In addition, there is no evidence that Emperor Wu was inspired to expand the park after reading Sima Xiangru's fu.

David B. HONEY, "Songs from Seclusion: A Rhetorical Reading of *Shih-chi* 9, 'Basic Annals of Grand Dowager Lü'"

The "Basic Annals of Grand Dowager Lü," Shih-chi 9, reads ostensibly like a straightforward if occasionally gruesome recital of the rule of Lü T'ai-hou, a not very pleasant power behind the throne of the aging Exalted Ancestor Liu Pang, and, after his death, a ruthless champion of the fortune of her family. It further recounts the nominal administrations of her son Emperor Hui and two puppet successors, Emperor Shao and Emperor T'ai. Since it covers the reigns of three different monarchs, its episodic treatment seems little more than a bare recital of misdeeds and malfeasance orchestrated by the dowager and her baleful clan, to the great misfortune of the royal house of Liu. Yet, the narrative clarity of this chapter renders Ssu-ma Ch'ien's rhetorical devices, especially his structuring imagery, remarkably visible to the sensitive reader.

My use of the term "sensitive" in this case implies two things. First, it implies that a close reading of the text will reveal purposeful utilization of repetitive images that both structure the narrative and interlink related episodes. These images provide the interpretive key to the theme of this chapter and its historiographical message. Second, and of most importance, a "sensitive reading" is done by one who has been sensitized by Stephen Durrant's recent work to Ssu-ma Ch'ien's self-revelatory narrative techniques. For the thrust of *The Cloudy Mirror: Tension and*

Conflict in the Writings of Sima Qian (1995) is that Ssu-ma Ch'ien utilized a consistent authorial point of view and a persistent set of narrative techniques to accomplish one overarching aim: to link historiographically and rhetorically the great historical figures of the past to his present historical, political, and personal situation. Emotional self-justification and social self-exoneration, then, must be seen as indispensable interpretive tools for assessing the historical "meaning" of most parts of the *Shih-chi*. These aims are particularly noticeable in this chapter.

Scott W. GALER, "Another Look at 'The Basic Annals of Emperor Ching the Filial': 'Exasperatingly Dull' . . . or Not?"

To readers who are familiar with Ssu-ma Ch'ien's narrative style in the Shih chi, the eleventh fascicle ("The Basic Annals of Emperor Ching the Filial") must seem an obvious departure from the conventions and tone he sets forth in the first ten pen-chi. The detailed anecdotes and reconstructed dialogues common in parts of the earlier basic annals, as well as in many of the later "memoirs" and "hereditary houses," are curiously absent in this chapter. Burton Watson considers this account "exasperatingly dull," with its simple contents of administrative acts, personnel changes, and records of natural phenomena. Following Chavannes' ideas, Watson also notes that several commentators throughout history have considered this chapter not to be the work of Ssu-ma Ch'ien, it possibly being an interpolation based on the Han shu account of Emperor Ching's reign.

While a definitive statement on the authorship of this chapter may never be possible, in this paper I attempt to take a closer look at its narrative composition and content with the hope of uncovering those parts of the text which may inspire curiosity and interest rather than insipidity.

Session 2

LÜ Zongli, "Myth or History? The Battle of the Fei River"

One of the interesting issues in the study of Chinese historiography is how far traditional historians may have gone from actual, historical recording to myth- or fiction-making. A probably no less interesting issue may be to what extent we modern students of Chinese history are capable and eligible of judging the authenticity of a historical record, and distinguishing the mythic and fictional from the actual, when lacking solid evidence.

Almost thirty years ago Michael C. Rogers furnished an example of how the compilers of the *Chin shu* legendized and fictionalized the accounts in Fu Chien's chronicle, in his "The Myth of the Battle of the Fei River (A.D. 383)," and *The Chronicle of Fu Chien: A Case of Exemplar History*.

Rogers' examination of episodes of the *Chronicle of Fu Chien* and his discussion of the political, intellectual, and historiographical background of the compilation of the *Chin shu* is careful and sophisticated. His comments on the ethical and propagandist concerns in traditional Chinese historiography in general, and the compilation of the *Chin shu* in particular, are very suggestive. Nevertheless, when he comes out with the assumption or conclusion that "the account of the Fei River battle cannot be taken as a description of an actual event," "the Lo Creek battle was the only one that really took place between the forces of Chin and Ch'in in 383, and that it served as the pattern for the story of the Fei River," problems occur.

1) Ignorance or underestimation of the historical sources by the northern historians, such as the *Wei shu* and *Shih-liu-kuo ch'un-ch'iu*, results in an absence of fair textual comparison between the episodes in the chronicle and other relevant sources; 2) textual conflicts of certain aspects of the battle among different sources are questionable, yet not sufficient to repudiate the historicity of the battle as a whole; 3) a thorough textual investigation reveals that the actuality of the battle was commonly accepted by contemporaries and immediately later generations, in both the south and the north.

Paul W. KROLL, "The Road to Shu, Before Li Po"

One of Li Po's "signature" poems is his famous "Shu tao nan." As was often the case, Li Po in this poem was reworking and turning to new effect a theme and *yüeh-fu* title that had been exploited by others before him. Examination of these prior works reveals much about Li Po's methods of adaptation and invention, as does reference to other poems by him that evoke the

perilous landscape of Shu. Of the many works that shed some light on Li Po's "Shu tao nan," the most important are Chang Tsai's late-third-century "Inscription for Sword Gallery" and the poet's own "Sword Gallery Fu."

Ding Xiang WARNER, "The Role of Wang Tong (584?-617) and his Academy"

Wang Tong, a Sui-dynasty Confucian teacher posthumously known as Wenzhongzi (Master Wenzhong), is regarded as one of the great masters of philosophy in Chinese history and a significant precursor of the development of neo-Confucianism. His purported disciples included such eminent statesmen as Wei Zheng, Fang Xuanling, and Xue Shou of the Sui and the early Tang dynasty, men who were instrumental in the shaping of court policy during this period of reunification.

Yet scholars have always been troubled by the silence of the dynastic histories concerning Wang Tong's academy and its role in the training of his famous disciples, as well as the omission of his biography from the *Sui shu*. Some skeptics have questioned the authenticity of the teachings ascribed to Wang Tong, and even his historical existence, while others have suggested that some sort of political intrigue at court resulted in the suppression of Wang Tong's identity and contributions.

I will argue in this paper that there is sufficient evidence to show that Wang Tong and his family retained a close relationship, even a master-disciple relationship, with some of the eminent court officials of the period. But I will also suggest that ideological differences, not political machinations, explain the suppression of Wang Tong's links to these and other Sui and Tang statesmen in the imperial histories. For while Wang Tong promoted a rigidly conservative, classicizing approach to the Confucian canon, the brand of Confucian orthodoxy promoted at court, it will be shown, drew heavily upon the hermeneutic tradition of the Han scholarship that Wang Tong rejected.

J. Michael FARMER, "Some Notes on the Historiographical Tradition in Early Medieval Shu"

The region of Shu possessed an early and vibrant historiographical tradition. Rising from the field of classical studies, this historiographical tradition developed in several important directions, and produced a number of influential historians and works. The first of such works, the Basic Annals of the Kings of Shu, may have been a collaborative work by a number of notable Shu literati, including Sima Xiangru and Yang Xiong. Later, the intellectual currents in Shu turned towards the art of prognostication and divination—seemingly away from their previous historiographical bent. However, from a certain lineage of Shu prognosticators came one of the most important Shu historians, Qiao Zhou. Qiao produced the first commentary on Sima Qian's Grand Scribe's Records, the Investigations on Ancient History, basing his critique and commentary on a firm knowledge of the classics. Qiao also wrote a number of local histories of the region. In addition to Qiao Zhou's own historical writings, he was also the mentor of Shu's greatest early medieval historian, Chen Shou. Chen Shou's Records of the Three States stands as a model work of contemporary history. Chen utilized the wealth of extant resources from the historical offices in the states of Wei and Wu, and his own intimate knowledge of recent Shu history to complie the text. From his treatment of the recent past, special problems and concerns in the practice of contemporary history are revealed. In addition to this masterpiece, Chen also compiled biographies of prominent local figures entitled Biographies of the Elders of Yi. Following Chen Shou in this tradition was Chang Qu, whose Record of the State South of Mt. Hua became a model work in the genre of local history. Chang's work is a collage of geographical, historical, and biographical information on the early medieval southwest. From an examination of these master historians and their works, several trends emerge in Shu historiography. Three major types of historiography were practiced in early medieval Shu: ancient history, based on a knowledge of the classical historical texts; contemporary history, as exemplified by Chen Shou's Records of the Three States, and to a lesser extent by Chang Qu's Record of the State South of Mt. Hua; and most importantly, local history, as seen in most of the aforementioned historians' works. The tendencey to compile local history seems to be the most important characteristic in early medieval Shu historiography.

Donald HOLZMAN, "Filial Piety: China's Bane or Glory" Abstract not available at time of printing.

Mark L. ASSELIN, "The Continuity of the Han Epitaph"

Confucius lamented his being too late to have lived in an age fully in harmony with the Tao, under the sagacious rule of the legendary emperors of early antiquity, but was consoled by knowing that "I have the accounts about them." Thus the written word afforded Confucius a measure of continuity with a remote and dim past. In the troubled years of the late Eastern Han dynasty, a new genre of literature, the beiwen (stele inscriptions), helped meet a strongly felt need for continuity. Among the important reasons for the rise of beiwen, which at this time usually denotes a kind of epitaph, are the growing emphasis on xiao (filial piety) as a measure of character and worthiness for official life, the extension of xiao to include obligations to teachers, patrons, and rulers, the corresponding and continuing practice of lavish burial, and the desire in those uncertain times to preserve name and accomplishments. In this paper, I reflect on an aspect related to this final object of preserving a reputation, i.e., the conscious use of beiwen to provide a continuity between past and future. This continuity can be seen in the choice of stone as the material with which bei steles, and tombs for that matter, were made; in the pseudo-genealogies and exaltation of "personal" qualities; and in the celebration (or eulogizing) of traditional social values. Though the rise of the beiwen genre may be attributed in large part to a market demand driven by the self-aggrandizing practice of lavish burial, we must not underestimate the importance of the need for preservation and continuity to late Han society and to the development of the beiwen genre.

SU Jui-lung, "The Development and Transformation of the 'Sevens' "
Abstract not available at time of printing.

WANG Wei, "The Lost Paradise: A Different Reading of 'The Record of Peach Blossom Spring'"

This paper focuses on the textual details of Tao Qian's masterpiece to challenge the three traditional readings of the work, to highlight its inner contradictions and the differences between the prose account and the poem, and to offer my own strategy of reading the work. The problems with the traditional readings are: a) the "Taoist" reading ignores the essential differences that distinguish this work and other Taoist works; b) the "realistic" reading fails to set up any solid relationship between this work and the historical data this reading provides; c) the "idealistic" reading constructs a paradise on extra-textual evidence and neglects the tensions within the work. I will argue that the Peach Blossom Spring is not an ideal society, because: 1) the peach blossom should not be taken as a symbol of that ideal society; 2) the narrator emphasizes the similarities rather than the differences between the two societies; 3) the reaction of the villagers of Peach Blossom Spring indicates it was a less than ideal socsiety; and 4) the state of innocence is at once found and destroyed by the intrusion of the fisherman. My strategy of reading the work focuses on the images, the characters, the language and structure of the work, avoiding the attempt to reduce it to an abstract idea. The real beauty of the work is ini its descriptive nature and its enormous signifying power.

Session 4

Madeline K. SPRING, "Words of Caution from Liu Yuxi"

In the early 820s Liu Yuxi (772-842), then serving as prefect of Kuizhou (in Sichuan), composed a series of philosophical essays, which he entitled the "Qi lun." In these essays he reflected on some situations he had recently experienced. Each of these events (whether real or imagined) gave rise to Liu's critical comments about weaknesses he observed in his contemporaries and their social values. The present study discusses the general themes and structural devices Liu uses to advance his arguments in these insightful and entertaining writings.

Robert ASHMORE, "'The Stone Kettle Linked Verses' and Ninth-Century Wit"
Abstract not available at time of printing.

Suzanne CAHILL, "T'ang Material Culture and the Tao: A New Look at the Poetry of Yü Hsüan-chi"

Yü Hsüan-chi (844-868), a poet, courtesan, and Taoist nun, lived a short and violent life near the end of the T'ang dynasty. Executed for murder in 868, she gained a reputation in later history and literature as a disruptive woman who defied social convention, intellectual norms, and ultimately the law. Fifty of her poems, probably less than a quarter of her total output, survive today in the Ch'üan T'ang shih. Biographical accounts of her appear in several sources written within a few decades of her death.

Yü Hsüan-chi has always been a controversial figure. In the light of new studies of Taoism, T'ang material culture, and women's history, I believe that it is time to reassess her contributions. If we want to study Yü Hsüan-chi, her thought, and her accomplishments, we cannot do better than to study her writings in the context of her time. Her poems reveal a startling intellect and an original voice, operating within the conventions of T'ang poetry. This paper examines images of material culture in her poetry as a window into her world. The multiple meanings of these images also illuminate medieval Chinese Taoism and women's culture.

Session 5

Muhammad Amanullah, "Controversy over the Amount of Blood Money for a Non-Muslin *Dhimmi* or *Mu'ahid* Victim"

Many non-Muslims of today live either permanently or temporarily all over the Muslim world. Some extreme Muslim groups occasionally target these non-Muslims, capture them, torture them, and sometimes kill them with the conviction that these acts are not prohibited in Islam. Islamic criminal law provides several rules for these offenses. Non-Muslims of today, especially those who permanently or temporarily live among Muslims, need to know what kind of rights they have under Islamic criminal law. Additionally, those Muslim governments who want to establish Islamic law in their countries also must understand the rules about the rights of non-Muslims. Among the issues of Islamic criminal law regarding non-Muslilms the issue of whether blood money of a non-Muslin victim is equal to that of a Muslim takes an important place in classical Islamic figh literature. A modern Western scholar, Tyan, has briefly described the controversy over this issue but also not in depth. However, these studies fall short of providing detailed justification of both supporters and opponents of this equality or lack thereof. This study, based on classical Islamic figh books, provides opinions and detailed justifications offered by classical Muslim jurists concerning this issue. This study concludes that Hanafi jurists, relying on Qur'anic, Sunna'ic, atharic, and rational arguments, maintain that blood money of a non-Muslim—whether Jew, Christian, or Magian, contracted (mu'ahid) or protected (dhimmi)—is equal to that of a Muslim. Other Muslim jurists, such as Malik, Shafi'i, and Ahmad, contradicting the Hanafi view, hold that *diyyah* of a non-Muslim is not equivalent to that of a Muslim. Although members of this second group of scholars try to establish their view through Qur'anic and Sunna'ic arguments, Hanafis counter these adillah. Based on arguments and counterarguments of Hanafis to their opponents, this research further concludes that the opinion of the Hanafi school of law about this issue is better supported than that of their opponents, and that the Hanafi view is more appropriate than the stance of their opponents in order to protect the rights of non-Muslims in an Islamic environment.

Edward E. PENG, "The Sketchy Haiku and the Heideggerian Sense of Time"

How to appreciate adequately the connotation implied by means of artistic expression in Japanese haiku poetry, especially the "Sketchy Haiku"? It largely depends on how we define haiku in a rather more abstract yet more illustrative way. Haiku may be regarded as a genre that is to depict the *Augenblick* that is coming to us—the flitting present in the Heideggerian sense—and the most impressive impact that this *Augenblick* causes to the poet. We may understand Sketchy Haiku more fully if we realize that the poet wants first to grasp the present and then the impression.

A haiku is, therefore, an *Augenblick* that the poet attempts to coagulate and then convey to the reader. According to Heidegger, "time is determined by a kind of being." Thus the poet has to record the most arresting impression to make this momentariness remain. Consequently, we may say that the Sketchy Haiku is an effor t to turn temporality to something more lastingly attractive—to him- or herself at any rate.

Richard John LYNN, "Huang Zunxian (1848-1905) and his Association with Meiji-Era Japanese Literati"

Huang Zunxian, diplomat, historian, and, perhaps, the last great traditional Chinese poet, served as counselor to the first imperial Chinese legation in Tokyo (1877-82). The foundation upon which Huang and Japanese bunjin (literati) acquaintances then built friendships was "This Culture of Ours" (siwen / shibun), the literary and scholarly tradition, primarily Confucian, shared formerly by the learned elites of East Asia. "This Culture of Ours" is mentioned often in Huang's Riben zashishi (Poems on Miscellaneous Subjects from Japan), a principal source for understanding Huang's relations with Japanese literati and their tradition. Other sources are the prefaces and postscripts that Huang and they wrote to each other's works and the collection of bitan / hitsudan ("brush talks"), the Ökôchi monjo (The Ökôchi Documents), written conversations in literary Chinese (wenyan / kanbun) between Huang and his Japanese friends and preserved by Ôkôchi Teruna (1848-82), former Lord of Takasaki Domain and army commissioner during the last year of the Bakufu (1867) and under the first year of the new Meiji regime (1868). Besides Ökôchi, members of Huang's circle included Ukai Tetsujô (1814-91), chief priest of the Chion'in (Awareness of Grace Temple) in Kyoto and also associated with the great Pure Land temple Zôjôji in Shiba (Tokyo), where the Chinese legation was first housed in a sub-temple, and Ishikawa Kôsai (1833-1918), prominent classical Chinese scholar (kangakusha) and Chinese verse (kanshi) poet. The fact that Huang and such bunjin shared the same cultural and intellectual heritage made him optimistic that the Confucian tradition would continue to span both cultures and sustain common ideals in the crucial years ahead, when he hoped China and Japan would stand united in the face of the Western challenge. Huang was committed to reform in China but no revolutionary, so for him tradition meant strength. In Japan, Huang found that "This Culture of Ours" was not limited to China but had become "Our" international tradition that reached beyond the borders of China and the bounds of Chinese ethnicity. His writings from these years are full of hope for the future and, though soon confounded by the unfolding course of Sino-Japanese relations, still deserve attention, for they describe a moment when a window of opportunity for East Asian cooperation and understanding opened briefly—a window now openng again, when prospects are infinitely better.

Stuart H. SARGENT, "The Dialogue between Haiku and Chinese Poetry"

Premodern literature in Japanese often contains echoes, faint or strong, of the Chinese literary heritage. Although in Genji monogatari certain allusions to Chinese precedent are explicit and well known, and contemporary scholars such as Konishi Jin'ichi are giving due attention to Chinese influence in certain genres and in certain ideas about literature, there is still much work to be done for us to hear all the continental echoes at the right volume—neither too loud nor too faint—as the readers and writers of earlier centuries heard them. The Japanese fondness for comparing Bashô and Tu Fu, which has resulted in a slow but steady trickle of books and articles over the years, would seem to be an exception to the general neglect of Japan-China literary relations. Yet we musk ask whether this pastime has helped us understand the haiku master's relationship with Chinese culture, or merely represents a superficial juxtaposition of two figures chosen because they are national icons. From mainland China comes a new perspective as scholars there begin to publish on Japanese literature: to the extent that they know their own tradition well or can use modern research tools to plumb that tradition, they should be able to see parallels and precedents that others have missed. The question here is: did Bashô know (and in what manner?) the texts they cite and does this data shed light on this writing, or are at least some similarities between his haiku and continental poetry merely a matter of coincidence? With these questions as my point of departure, I shall look at two contributions to the dialogue between haiku and Chinese poetry, Bashô to To Ho, by Ota Seikyû (Tokyo, 1971), and Riben paiju yü Zhongguo shige, by Sekimori Machio and Lu Jian (Hangzhou, 1996), and suggest the potentials

Session 6

JIA Jinhua, "An Interpretation of 'shi ke yi qun' 詩可以群

Confucius uses four terms to describe the function of the Shi (The Book of Poetry): xing 興 , guan 觀 , qun 群 , and yuan 怨 . The present paper will focus on the interpretation of the third term, qun, in the context of Confucius' usage. Traditional annotation and understanding of this term include "to live in a group and learn from one another," "to be agreeable with everybody," or "to teach the art of sociability." An etymological analysis of the graph, however, shows a different explanation. According to Shuowen jiezi and its many annotations, although the character 群 was used to indicate both a group of people and a group of animals in Confucius' time, the original and standard character to denote humans living in a group is qun 窘. Through graphicphonic analysis, we find that the etymon for 宭 is the component jun 君, and the etymon for 君 is the component yin 尹. Phonetic reconstructions of Archaic Chinese by modern scholars further demonstrate that the four characters 群, 窘, 君, and 尹 share the same final. It is noticeable that in the oracle-bone inscriptions, $\not\equiv$ and $fu \not \propto$ are represented by the identical graph $\not \prec$ or $\not \prec$. In the Shuowen jiezi, fu is defined as "a patriarch who gives instructions; the character consists of a hand lifting a stick." Tracing from yin all the way back to qun, we can see that yin is applied as a semantic-phonetic determiner for jun which represents the patriarch of a kinship group. Then, jun is used as a semantic-phonetic determiner for qun which can be defined as a kinship group led or governed by a patriarch. These interpretations of jun and gun can be further verified by the social organization of the Shang and Zhou dynasties. Shang society was based on kinship groups called zu 族. A landed lord represented hi zu group which lived in a walled town, so a lord was actually a patriarch and was called a jun, and a kinship group that dwelled in a walled town was called a qun. The patriarchal system, which appeared in the Shang and developed in the Zhou, was a stratified familial network of numerous kinship groups. Confucius was a keen adherent of the patriarchal system. When he uses qun as a verb to define the function of the Shi, he means that the Shi can be uses to secure the stratified relationships of indivduals and groups, and to maintain the ethics and humanity of the patriarchal structure.

Martin KERN, "The Stele Inscriptions of Ch'in Shih-huang: Mutations within the Tradition of Chou Political Ritual"

The seven stele inscriptions, which the First Emperor of Ch'in placed on mountains in the eastern parts of the new empire, are recognized as being loaded with "Confucian" political rhetoric. Certainly they are pieces of propaganda, and this may be one reason why no attempt has been made to accept them as serious sources and to integrate them into the political and intellectual history of their times. They have never been scrutinized in order to reveal their concrete ideological references and literary contexts; rather, they are placed almost beyond what is understood as the "real" history. Contrary to this, I propose to detach the texts from their pejorative historiographical surroundings—Ssu-ma Ch'ien's "Basic Annals" of the First Emperor—and try to reconstruct their actual historical background. Although the "genre" of the stele inscription was a genuine innovation in Chinese culture, both the ritual context and the literary structure of the texts bind them closely to traditional ritual practices (the ruler's tour of inspection) and texts (Chou-time bronze inscriptions and political eulogies). The First Emperor's boasting representation, despite its again propagandistic condemnation in Han times, is strongly traditional. This finding may be related to other evidence that *ju* ("Confucianist") and *fa* ("Legalist") ideologies—if we are asked to accept these categories at all for pre-Han times—were in many respects closely interwoven in Ch'in political culture; furthermore, both the historiographical and the archeological records provide confirmation of ritual continuity from Eastern Chou through Ch'in into early Han times. The investigation into some concrete features of the inscriptions will unveil their framework of Chou ritual-political culture and raise questions on the tension between Ch'in history and Han historiography.

David S. NIVISON, "The Riddle of the Bamboo Annals"

This paper describes a book of the same title, written by me in the spring of 1995 and revised last winter, using earlier work by D. Pankenier, E. Shaughnessy, and myself. The PRC has recently launced a huge four-year chronology project to solve the very problems this book already solves. This paper is in part a "position paper" attempting to reach the attention of the directors of the project in China. While I seek a publisher with prestige enough to force journals to review my book, I am making it widely available; I have copyrighted it, but ask only for due acknowledgement whenever parts are "downloaded" and used (web site http://www.stanford.edu/~dnivison).

The "present text" Bamboo Annals, often held to be a fake, is a chronicle that pretends to give exact dates of reigns and major events back to the late third millennium B.C. I claim that with minor exceptions it is the actual text as burined in or soon after 299 B.C. (its last date). The dates of reigns in this text are mostly incorrect before 841 B.C., chiefly because mourning intervals between reigns have been deleted. These defects can be corrected by using astronomical references, etc., to yield a probably correct chronology in detail, reign by reign, back at least to 2037 B.C. This must be before the "mythical" Emperor Yao—who must, therefore, not be wholly mythical. Twenty years ago I would have dismissed such claims as quite crazy. To provide adequate evidence for them would be to confront and solve "the riddle of the Bamboo Annals." I believe that my book does this.

Session 7

YU Shiyi, "Taoist Scripture-Teaching and Interpretain of the Classics in Medieval China"

This paper offers a reconstruction of Taoist scripture-teaching in the medieval period. Comparison is made with the similar practice of Buddhists at that time, and the general cultural significance of the practice is discussed. Analysis will focus on the role of the *dharma* master's helper on the platform—the chanter, or in Chinese the *tu chiang*, and how the historical change in this role transformed the way of reading and interpreting the classics.

Jan NATTIER, "Searching for the Elusive 'Pure Land': A Prakrit Prototype of ching-t'u 净土 "

One of the most influential concepts in East Asian Buddhism is the idea of the *ching-t'u* or "Pure Land," a heavenly realm in which the faithful can be reborn in the presence of Amitābha Buddha after death. Yet despite several decades of studies by Japanese and Western scholars, no Sanskrit antecedent of this widely used expression has been identified.

In this paper we suggest that the term *ching-t'u* may have resulted from a confusion between Prakrit equivalents of Sanskrit *vyūha* "array, arrangement" and *viśuddha* "purified." Specifically, we demonstrate that such a confusion could easily come about through a combination of the ambiguities of the Kharosthi script and certain Prakrit (most likely Gandhari) sound shifts.

After considering several instances in which Sanskrit vyūha was apparently translated into Chinese as ching "pure," we conclude that the expression ching-t'u may have been based on a Prakrit form of kṣetravyūha, a term that occurs quite frequently in early Mahayana texts.

Tim Wai-keung CHAN, "A Poem on Daoist Esoteric and Exoteric Practices by Chen Ziang"

The theme of the first of the thirty-eight "Ganyu" poems by Chen Ziang (661-702) has aroused much conjecture. Since Chen Hang's (1785-1826) influential interpretation, presented in his *Shi bixing jian*, most if not all later, even modern, scholars treat the poem as political allegory. Such interpretation guides scholars to dig out "evidence" to support a univalent meaning, which holds that the poet employed ambiguous language so as to avoid any repercussions from expressing his loyalty to the Tang throne which had by then been usurped by Empress Wu (r. 690-705).

Disagreeing with this "intentional fallacy," I take another look at the poem and attempt to decipher its mysterious imagery. Certain uses of diction reveal clear Daoist overtones in this poems. It is still troublesome to label it as a poem on Daoist alchemy, because the theme seems to be binary: it focuses on both *neidan* and *waidan*. The moon in the poem stands for the process of this practice, a quite common analogue in Daoist prescriptions. Chen's notion can be traced directly to Wei Boyang's (Eastern Han) *Zhouyi cantongqi*, a seminal treatise on Chinese alchemy.

This reading provides an alternative understanding of Chen's work and frees our view

from standard scenarios such as his "innovations" in Tang poetry and his "loyalty" toward the Tang throne. Instead, light is shed on a rarely touched facet, Chen's Daoist poetry.

Laurence G. THOMPSON, "Chinese Religion Studies: Observations on Recent Bibliography"

By "recent bibliography" is meant the five years between 1991 and 1995, a time period covered by the latest version of a bibliography compiled by myself, with the editorial assistance of Gary Seaman. Among the "observations" that are made, particular attention is paid to the question of the place of Chinese religion among world religions, as this is brought out in the Western-language writings of the period.

Session 8

Timothy C. WONG, "Fiction as Pretense in the Chinese Tradition"

It is a fact well-known but well-ignored that various prominent leaders of the movement to "modernize" Chinese fiction earlier this century were not champions of Chinese fiction as a whole. Even though some of the most prominent among them—such as Lu Xun and Zheng Zhenduo—retained a scholarly interest in the *xiaoshuo* fiction of the past, they nevertheless denounced, sometimes bitterly, the so-called *jiupai* 舊派 or "old-style" fiction which flourished in China's most culturally important cities of Shanghai, Beijing, and Tianjin.

This kind of fiction was labelled *jiupai* not because of its subject matter, which deals largely with people and happenings in the urban centers of the time. In Shanghai, it was considered a product of the "extended foreign mail" 千里洋場,and hence very much *au courant*. This kind of writing, then as now referred to pejoratively as "Mandarin Ducks and Butterflies" (*yuanyang hudie*), was only "old" because it follows the traditional habit of fictionalizing as pretense, of expanding actuality with make-believe—for the purpose of disengaging from rather than confronting boring or harsh reality. Little wonder why those who pledged to use the fictional medium to awaken China to her political plights saw the old habit as a threat to their adopted mission and to the nation's welfare.

There are a number of reasons why traditional *xiaoshuo* fiction is almost never examined on its own terms in our time. Chief among these must be China's continuing unwillingness to consider fiction as pretense, an unwillingness that dovetails perfectly with the current "postmodernist" tendency to regard all fiction as real, serious, and politically engaged.

Stephen H. WEST, "Court, Desire, and Consumption in the Eastern Capital of the Northern Song"

The *Dongjing meng Hua lu* is divided into two major sections: the first five chapters deal with the spatial arrangement of the city and the second five with the annual festivals and events that marked ordinary life there. While the first part of the text makes a persuasive claim for "space" as a resistant claim against ritual and fixed "place," the second part of the text deals primarily with episodes of imperial intrusion into this resistant space. The first part of the text cannot only be seen as a narrative creation of a resistant, tattered space that flows between and around the fixed ritual order of institutional place but also as a narrative replication of an urban area organized (in this text) mainly around commercial interests.

The second part of the text is curiously focused on imperial progresses as a kind of street theater. Discussions and descriptions of the court are carried on in the context of the material trappings of life and of style, consumption, and economic gain. This is an outgrowth in many respects of the first part of the *Dongjing meng Hua lu* in that it recreates the court as an integral part of ordinary life, stripped of ritual significance, but at the top of a pyramid of consumption and sumptuary interests. The court is mainly seen as a corporate body that sets the style and mode of such mundane features of life as clothing, food, and conveyance. The text is highly specific about all of the external trappings of court life, particularly those secular rituals and progresses that create and sustain an area of permeable boundaries between court and city. This results in a curious treatment of court life in which the emperor, particularly, is seen as a dispenser of largess and as the creator of cirumstance for urban entertainment.

This paper investigates the function of the court within this new urban, commercial

setting, looking at how it set styles of consumption, particularly in food and clothing.

Stephen WADLEY, "Stuck in Pekin Singin Dem Ol' Manchu Blues"

Zidi shu 子弟書 was a song form popular among the Manchus during the middle to late Qing dynasty. Most of the song lyrics still extant look to be little different in theme with Chinese shuochang wenxue of this and earlier periods, i.e., they are songs about the heroes and heroines of Chinese fiction and fictionalized history: songs on themes and characters in Shuihu zhuan, Sanguo yanyi, Xixiang ji, Hunglou meng, etc. There is a subgenre of perhaps two dozen songs still extant, however, that take for its theme the troubles in the lives of ordinary Manchus in various occupations. They can be grouped together by the fact that their titles all end with the word tan, "to sigh" or "lament." Though they cannot be seriously equated to the later "blues" type of music invented by African Americans in the early part of this century, their lyrics evoke a somewhat similar mood. They narrate hard times experienced by servants, teachers, beggars, scribes, cooks, opium smokers, soldier's wives, and others, and thus give us a glimpse into daily life of the period.

Victoria CASS, "Geishas in the Southern Cities of the Late Ming: Wealthy Entrepreneurs, Published Writers, and Social Iconoclasts—Another Reflection of the jubian"

Abstract not available at time of printing.

Session 9

Stephen DURRANT, "Did the Luese and Qiese Save Civilization? (And Did Sima Qian Like Them?)

As is well-known, scholars from the region of Lu and Qi (roughly modern Shandong) are largely responsible for transmitting the classical tradition of Zhou China. Sima Qian (145-86? B.C.) even ventured that "literary scholarship in the regions of Qi and Lu, from antiquity to the present time, seems to be a heavenly endowment!" (Shi ji 121.3117). Indeed, most of the early Han "Masters of Broad Learning" (bo shi) came from the region of these two old Zhou states and

brought their considerable learning to the western capital.

Sima Qian was a devoted scholar of the classics and, as such, owed much of his own learning to the tradition preserved in Lu and Qi. At the same time, he himself had been born in the old Qin area and derived from a military family that had been active in the Qin/Jin region, which Qian Mu and others have argued was a cultural rival of Lu and Qi. One can discern in Sima Qian genuine reservations about "easterners," particularly men of Qi. These reservations, of course, result to some extent from the "Masters of Magical Techniques" (fangs hi) who clustered around Emperor Wu (r. 141-87) and were almost all men of Qi. Sima Qian even generalizes, through the mouth of Ji An, that "the men of Qi" are "full of deceit and . . . without regard for truth" (120.3108). And this criticism of the men of Qi seems to extend beyond the fang shi to such "flattering Confucians" as the notorious Gongsun Hong, who was the most politically successful Qi scholar in the age of Sima Qian.

In fact, there is evidence within Shi ji of a regional rivalry between west and east, with Sima Qian attached to the more "inarticulate but honest" (softball playing?) westerners rather than the glib but untrustworthy easterners.

Howard Y. F. CHOY, "Did Confucius Take Showers? An Etymological Trace of ru 儒 "

Ru is conventionally translated as "Confucian(s)." In his book Confucius and the Chinese Way (originally titled Confucius: The Man and the Myth), H. G. Creel suggests interpreting ru as "weaklings." He also asserts that ru "was not yet a current term for 'Confucian' in the Master's own day." Creel's attempt at an alternative reading of ru is interesting, but his study is limited to the Han period (206 B.C.-A.D. 220). Pre-Han materials show that the concept of ru predates Confucius (551/2-479 B.C.) himself. The question is, who were the ru? When and where did they first appear? What was the relationship of Confucius to them? How were they perceived before the Qin dynasty (221-206 B.C.)? This paper seeks answers to these questions with specific focus on the origin of the character ru, the social status of the ru as a class, and their rituals. In light of recent discoveries of oracle-bone and bronze inscriptions from Shang and Zhou times (ca. 1766-221 B.C.) as well as some classical texts, I propose a third possibility for the understanding of ru as "bathers," vaguely comparable with "Baptists." This view may lead to further investigation of the religiousness of the early ru.

Session 10

Daniel HSIEH, "Scholar-foxes in Chinese Fox Stories"

Mention "fox story" or "fox fairy" and most modern readers of Chinese literature will think of the beautiful, fascinating, often dangerous heroines of romances such as "The Story of Miss Ren" ("Ren shi zhuan") and the many fox tales in Strange Tales from a Chinese Studio (Liaozhai zhiyi). The rise, however, of the figure of the female fox fairy and lover is just one side of the long and complex tradition of Chinese fox stories. Moreover, it is a figure that only gradually came to predominate in the latter half of the tradition. Originally, at least as many fox stories featured male fox spirits as their protagonists. Male foxes appear in a number of guises ranging from mischievous goblins to lascivious sexual creatures. One of the most striking and interesting types of male fox, however, is the scholar-fox. Foxes who love to study and strive to advance appear very early in the zhiguai tradition of fox stories, and later writers would continue to draw upon this image. In the Soushen ji foxes match their learning and wits with scholars such as Zhang Hua and Dong Zhongshu; a number of Pu Songling's fox tales contain elegant, learned foxes. This paper is an attempt to survey the tradition of scholar-foxes and offer some possible explanations for their appearance.

Deborah RUDOLPH, "The Vernacularization of Morality: Yüan Chen's 'Tale of Ying-ying' and Wang Shih-fu's Story of the Western Wing"

Abstract not available at time of printing.

Shu Yong JIANG, "The Development of Wu Tzu-hsü's Story in Li Shou-ch'in's Wu Yün ch'ui hsiao"

Wu Tzu-hsü's revenge was recorded in historic works dated to the pre-Ch'in period, and took shape as an imaginative and interesting story in *pien-wen*. In Yüan *tsa-chü*, this became a popular subject and, due to its legendary nature, was adapted in episodes of many works. In the development of this story, we see changes in the plot and characters. In this paper, I will discuss the development of the Wu Tzu-hsü story in Li Shou-ch'ing's Wu Yün ch'ui hsiao by analyzing the differences displayed in this Yüan drama and its earlier counterparts. The comparison between the earlier texts of Wu's story and Yüan drama, particularly Li Shou-ch'ing's play, is based on a careful review of the traditional sources and a general description of the adaptations in Yüan drama. By tracing down the changes of the plot and characters from earlier versions of this story through Yüan drama, it is hoped that this case study can provide evidence to support the hypothesis that Sung storytellers are the immediate predecessors of Yüan playwrights and that the rise and popularity of oral storytelling in the Sung dynasty are the significant forces shaping the characteristics of Yüan drama.

Kathleen TOMLONOVIC, "A Preference for Chronology in the Transmission of Poetry Collections of Song Dynasty Literati"

Although it was only one of several means of arranging the poetry of scholar officials of the Song dynasty, the chronologically arranged edition came to be the preferred form used by Qing-era and modern collators. Because the editor, even while seeking authorial intention, had the potential of supplementing meaning through the layout and arrangement of the text, it is significant to observe how poems were presented in the various collections.

In the case of Su Shih's (1037-1101) poetry, three representative editions circulated during the Southern Song. These collections were arranged respectively on the basis of 1) genre/form, 2) topic, 3) chronology. Traditionally, poetry collections were arranged according to form, specifically the *gu shi* (old-style poems), *lü shi* (regulated verse), and *jueju*. Song-era literati who were involved in the editing of their collected works arranged prose according to genre and poetry according to form. Apparently, Su Shi arranged his *Dongpo ji* in this manner; the *Houji* (Later

Collection) and the *Xuji* (Continued Collection) poems were also arranged accordingly, thus constituting three sections of the complete works of *Qiji* (Seven Collections). Retention of the genre/form arrangement is notable in the *Siku quanshu* collectance editions not only of Su Shi's works but also those of Owners Viv (1007, 1079), and the Collectance of Courses Viv (1007, 1079), and the Collectance of Courses Viv (1007, 1079), and the Collectance of Courses Viv (1007, 1079).

works, but also those of Ouyang Xiu (1007-1072) and Huang Tingjian (1045-1105).

However, the Southern Song edition of Su Shi's poetry that circulated most widely throughout China and Asia was the *Baijia zhu fenlei Dongpo shi ji* which classified Su Shi's poems into more than seventy categories such as travel. landscape, and parting poems. Although the topically arranged editions enjoyed popularity, most Qing collators disparaged them as arbitrary. Instead, Qing editors respected and preferred chronologically arranged collections such as the *Shi Gu zhu Su shi* edited by Shi Yuanzhi (*jinshi* 1154) and his lay colleague Gu Jingfan. As evidenced in the acclaimed edition of Wang Wengao (b. 1764), the *Su Wenzhong gong shi bianzhu jicheng*, chronologically arranged poetry served also to document a life. A modern edition, *Su Shi shiji*, published in 1982, retains the chronology. If the textual history of Su Shi's poetry is exemplary, we may assume that contemporary editors of the poetry of China's traditional authors will also employ a chronological sequence. The intimate connection between life and literary expression emphasized by Chinese critics is intensified by the editorial arrangements in the transmission of texts.